# Skeleton 02.01.01 Manual 

Nikolai Yu. Zolotykh<br>with participation of Aleksey Bader, Sergey Lobanov, Sergey Lyalin<br>N.I. Lobachevsky State University of Nizhni Novgorod, Russia

July 11, 2010


#### Abstract

This paper describes Skeleton: implementation of several new variations of well-known Double Description Method (DDM) for solving the vertex and facet enumeration problems for convex polyhedra. New enhancements makes Skeleton quite competitive in comparison with other implementations of DDM. The source code of Skeleton 02.01.01 is available at http://www.uic.nnov.ru/~zny/skeleton.


## Contents

1 What's new? ..... 2
2 Introduction ..... 3
3 Theoretical Preliminaries ..... 4
3.1 Polyhedral Cones ..... 4
3.2 Polyhedra ..... 6
3.3 The main idea of the algorithm ..... 8
4 How to Build ..... 9
5 How to Use ..... 9
6 Options ..... 11
7 More Examples ..... 14
7.1 Cube With a Cutted Vertex ..... 14
7.2 Implicit equations and redundant inequalities ..... 17
7.3 Skeleton "extended" format ..... 18
7.4 Avis-Fukuda format ..... 18
7.5 Voronoi Diagram ..... 19
7.6 Delaunay Triangulation ..... 21

## 1 What's new?

Skeleton 02.00.00 May 7, 2006
It is new, completely re-written, fast version of Skeleton.
Skeleton 02.00.01 November 1, 2006
SkELETON now runs on Linux platform. Source code is available.
Skeleton 02.00.02 November 7, 2006
Floating point arithmetic is now supported.
Skeleton 02.00.03 May 30, 2007
Time bug fixed.
Skeleton 02.00.04 October 6, 2009
A bug occuring on 64 bit architecture fixed. (Thanks to Sergey Lyalin and Sergey Lobanov.)
Skeleton 02.01.00 November 16, 2009:

- The possibility to explicitly set a system of linear equations in addition to a system of linear inequalities. See --skeletonformat option.
- New option --ridges for constructing ridges.
- New option --facetadjacency for constructing lists of adjacent facets.
- New option --verifyine to determine implicit equations and redundand inequalities in the input system.
- Avis-Fukuda format is now (partially) supported. See --avisfukudaformat option.
- New option --silence is available.
- New options --inputfromstdin, --noinputfromstdin are now available.
- According GNU style in long option names double hyphen is used instead of single hypen, for example, --minindex instead of -minindex.
- -graphinc option is renamed --graphadj (from graph of potential adjacency).
- -inc option is renamed --dis (from discrepancies).
- -minedges, -maxedges options are renamed --minpairs and --maxpairs correspondingly.
- -incext, -noincext, -incine, -noincine options are renamed --extinc, --noextinc, --ineinc, --noineinc correspondingly.

Skeleton 02.01.01 July 11, 2010
Installation procedure became simpler. Make file (for Linux) and project file (for MS Visual Studio) are provided now. Arageli is in the Skeleton distribution now and you need not to install Arageli separately. A lot of thanks to Aleksey Bader and Sergey Lyalin.

## 2 Introduction

It is well known that any polyhedron in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$ can be represented by the following two ways:
(1) as a set of solutions to the system of linear inequalities, or
(2) as the (Minkowski's) sum of the conic hull of some vectors and the convex hull of some points in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$.

The problem to generate representation (2) if representation (1) is available is called the vertex enumeration problem. The converse one is called the facet enumeration problem, or convex hull problem.

Analogously, any polyhedral cone in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$ can be represented by the following two ways:
(1) as a set of solutions to the system of homogenius linear inequalities, or
(2) as a set of all non-negative linear combinations of some vectors in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$.

There is a standard way to reduce vertex/facet enumeration problem for polyhedra to the correspondent problem for polyhedral cones. From theoretical point of view it is convenient to consider both problems just for polyhedral cones.

The program Skeleton implements several variations of Double Description Method (DDM) [MRTT53] solving the vertex and facet enumeration problems. DDM is considered in a few papers and monographs [Bur56, Che64, Che65, Che68a, VPS84, Che68b, FQ88, Ver92, FP96, SC97, SG03].

Skeleton works with the system of linear inequalities whose entries are integers (arbitrary precision or 4 bytes long ints) or reals (double floating point numbers).

In our implementation we use ideas descibed in [VPS84, FP96, SC97] and some new enhancements. All these makes SkELETON quite competitive in comparison with other implementations of DDM, in particular, [Ver92, Fuk02, Gru03]. Early version of Skeleton is described in [Zol97].

Skeleton can be distributed under the terms of GNU GENERAL PUBLIC LICENSE Version 2. Read file COPYING.

Thanks to Sergey Lobanov you can use Skeleton on-line (without install it). Visit http://www.arageli.org.

## 3 Theoretical Preliminaries

### 3.1 Polyhedral Cones

Polyhedral cone $C$ is the set of all solutions to a system of homogenius linear inequalities and equations $A x \geq 0, B x=0$ :

$$
C=\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: A x \geq 0, B x=0\right\},
$$

where $A \in \mathbf{R}^{m \times d}, B \in \mathbf{R}^{t \times d}$ ( $m$ or/and $t$ may be equal to 0 that corresponds to the case when inequalities or/and equations are absent accordingly). The case of system of equations and inequalities can be obviously reduced to the case of system with only inequalities. For this instead of $B x=0$ we can consider $B x \geq 0$ and $-B x \geq 0$. But it will be more convinient to consider the more general case.

The maximal subspace contained in the cone $C$ can be described as a set of all solutions to the system $A x=0, B x=0$. The dimension of this subspace is equal to $d-\operatorname{rank}\left(A^{\top}, B^{\top}\right)$. The cone is called pointed if it contains only zero subspace, that's equivalent to $\operatorname{rank}\left(A^{\top}, B^{\top}\right)=d$.

Let $a \in \mathbf{R}^{d}, a \neq 0$. The hyper-plane $\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: a x=0\right\}$ is called supporting for the cone $C$ if $C \subseteq\{x: a x \geq 0\}$ or $C \subseteq\{x: a x \leq 0\}$. The intersection of the cone with a supporting hyper-plain is called its face.

Consider the system of vectors $u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}$ in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$. The linear hull $\operatorname{Lin}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)$ of the system is the set of all linear combinations of these vectors:

$$
\operatorname{Lin}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)=\left\{\lambda_{1} u_{1}+\ldots+\lambda_{p} u_{p}: \quad \lambda_{i} \in \mathbf{R}(i=1, \ldots, p)\right\}
$$

The non-negative, or conic, hull $\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)$ of the system is the set of all non-negative linear combinations:

$$
\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)=\left\{\lambda_{1} u_{1}+\ldots+\lambda_{p} u_{p}: \lambda_{i} \in \mathbf{R}, \lambda_{i} \geq 0(i=1, \ldots, p)\right\}
$$

Theorem 1 (Minkowski) For any polyhedral cone $C$ in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$ there exist vectors $u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}, v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}$ in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$ such that

$$
C=\operatorname{Lin}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)+\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}\right)
$$

Obviously, w.l.g. in Minkowski's theorem we can omit $\operatorname{Lin}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)$ item and instead of $(\star \star)$ write simply $C=\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}\right)$.

Using matrix notation we can re-formulate Minkowski's theorem as follows. For any matrices $A \in \mathbf{R}^{m \times d}$ and $B \in \mathbf{R}^{t \times d}$ there exist matrices $V \in \mathbf{R}^{q \times d}$ and $U \in \mathbf{R}^{p \times d}$ such that

$$
\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: A x \geq 0, B x=0\right\}=\left\{x=\mu V+\lambda U: \mu \in \mathbf{R}^{n}, \mu \geq 0, \lambda \in \mathbf{R}^{s}\right\}
$$

Vectors $u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}, v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}$ (equvalently, matrices $U$ and $V$ ) can be chosen in such a way that the following properties of minimality hold:

1. $p=d-\operatorname{rank}\left(A^{\top}, B^{\top}\right)$ and $\operatorname{Lin}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)$ is the maximal subspace $L$ included in $C$ (so, the system $u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}$ is a basis of $L$ ); and
2. $q$ is minimal among all possible $q$ such that $(\star \star)$ holds (this means also that the system $v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}$ is irreducible); in this case the system $v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}$ is called a skeleton of the cone $C$.

The vectors in a skeleton are unique up to any positive multiplyer and any item in $L$. If the cone $C$ is pointed, i.e. $\operatorname{rank}\left(A^{\top}, B^{\top}\right)=d$ and, hence, $p=0$, then $v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}$ (and - up to positive multiplyer - only they) are extreme rays of $C$. We'll say that two vectors in a skeleton are adjacent if minimal face containing both does not contain any other vector in the skeleton.

The converse theorem to Minkowski's one is correct and is known as Weyl's theorem.

Theorem 2 (Weyl) For any vectors $u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}, v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}$ in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$ there exist matrices $A \in \mathbf{R}^{m \times d}$ and $B \in \mathbf{R}^{t \times d}$ such that

$$
\operatorname{Lin}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)+\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}\right)=\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: A x \geq 0, B x=0\right\}
$$

Obviously, w.l.g. in Weyl's theorem we can omit linear equations $B x=0$ and simply write $\operatorname{Lin}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)+\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}\right)=\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: A x \geq 0\right\}$.

Using matrix notation we can re-formulate Weyl's theorem as follows. For any matrices $U \in \mathbf{R}^{p \times d}$ and $V \in \mathbf{R}^{q \times d}$ there exist matrices $A \in \mathbf{R}^{m \times d}$ and $B \in \mathbf{R}^{t \times d}$ such that

$$
\left\{x=\lambda U+\mu V: \lambda \in \mathbf{R}^{p}, \mu \in \mathbf{R}^{q}, \mu \geq 0\right\}=\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: A x \geq 0, B x=0\right\} .
$$

Matrices $A$ and $B$ can be chosen in such a way that the following properties of minimality hold:

1. $t=d-\operatorname{rank}\left\{u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}, v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}\right\}$ and $\{x: B x=0\}$ is the minimal subspace containing $C$ (this means also that the system $B x=0$ is irreducible); and
2. $m$ is minimal among all possible $m$ such that $(\star)$ holds (this means also that the system $A x \geq 0$ is irreducible).

The rows in such a matrix $A$ are unique up to any positive multiplyer and any item which is linear combinations of rows in $B$. The rows in $A$ correspond to faces of maximum dimension. In particular, if the cone $C$ is full-dimensional, i.e. $\operatorname{rank}\left\{u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}, v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}\right\}=d$ and, hence, $t=0$, then the rows in $A$ correspond to facets of $C$.

These theorems suggest two fundamental problems. First one is to obtain a dual representation $(\star \star)$ if a representation $(\star)$ is known. The second problem is converse. It turns out that these problems are computationaly equivalent as the following theorem shows. So, we can concentate on the first problem.

Theorem 3 (Farkas-Minkowski-Weyl) If
$C=\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: A x \geq 0, B x=0\right\}=\left\{x=\mu V+\lambda U: \mu \in \mathbf{R}^{q}, \mu \geq 0, \lambda \in \mathbf{R}^{p}\right\}$
then
$C^{\prime}=\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: V x \geq 0, U x=0\right\}=\left\{x=\mu A+\lambda B: \mu \in \mathbf{R}^{m}, \mu \geq 0, \lambda \in \mathbf{R}^{t}\right\}$.

Moreover, if rows in $V$ and $U$ form a skeleton of $C$ and a basis of minimal subspace correspondingly, then $V x \geq 0, U x=0$ are irreducible systems determining $C^{\prime}$ and viceversa. Analogous property is true for $A$ and $B$.

### 3.2 Polyhedra

Polyhedron $P$ is the set of all solutions to a system of linear inequalities and equations $A x \geq b, B x=c$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
P=\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: A x \geq b, B x=c\right\} \tag{*}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $A \in \mathbf{R}^{m \times d}, B \in \mathbf{R}^{t \times d}, b \in \mathbf{R}^{m}, c \in \mathbf{R}^{t}$ ( $m$ or/and $t$ may be equal to 0 that corresponds to the case when inequalities or/and equations are absent accordingly). The case of system of equations and inequalities can be obviously reduced to the case of system with only inequalities. But it will be more convinient to consider the more general case.

Let $a \in \mathbf{R}^{d}, a \neq 0, \alpha \in \mathbf{R}$. The hyper-plane $\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: a x=\alpha\right\}$ is called supporting for the polyhedron $P$ if $P \cap\{x: a x=\alpha\} \neq \emptyset$ and $P \subseteq\{x: a x \geq \alpha\}$ or $P \subseteq\{x: a x \leq \alpha\}$. The intersection of the polyhedron with a supporting hyper-plane is called a face of the polyhedron. The face whith dimension 0 (i.e. a point) is called a vertex of $P$.

Consider the system of vectors $w_{1}, \ldots, w_{s}$ in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$. The convex hull $\operatorname{Conv}\left(w_{1}, \ldots, w_{s}\right)$ of the system is the set of all convex combinations of these vectors, i.e.:

$$
\operatorname{Conv}\left(w_{1}, \ldots, w_{s}\right)=\left\{\lambda_{1} w_{1}+\ldots+\lambda_{s} w_{s}: \quad \lambda_{i} \in \mathbf{R}, \quad \lambda_{i} \geq 0, \quad \sum_{i=1}^{s} \lambda_{i}=1\right\}
$$

The set of points in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$ which can be represented as a convex hull of some finite system of points is called polytope.

From Minkowski's theorem we get the following.
Theorem 4 For any polyhedron $P$ in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$ there exist vectors $u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}, v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}$, $w_{1}, \ldots, w_{s}$ in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$ such that

$$
\begin{equation*}
P=\operatorname{Lin}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)+\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}\right)+\operatorname{Conv}\left(w_{1}, \ldots, w_{s}\right) \tag{**}
\end{equation*}
$$

So, any polyhedron is the sum of a cone and a polytope.
Obviously, w.l.g. in the theorem we can omit $\operatorname{Lin}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)$ item and instead of $(* *)$ write simply $P=\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}\right)+\operatorname{Conv}\left(w_{1}, \ldots, w_{s}\right)$.

Vectors $u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}, v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}, w_{1}, \ldots, w_{s}$ can be chosen in such a way that the following properties of minimality hold:

1. $u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}$ is a basis of the subspace $L$ associated with the maximal linear variety in $P$; and
2. $q$ and $s$ are minimal among all possible $q$ and $s$ such that $(* *)$ holds (this means also that the systems $v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}$ and $w_{1}, \ldots, w_{s}$ are irreducible).

In this case vectors $w_{1}, \ldots, w_{s}$ are unique up to any item in $L$; vectors $v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}$ are unique up to any positive multiplyer and any item in $L$. If $p=0$ then points $w_{1}, \ldots, w_{s}$ (and only they) are vertices of $P$ and vectors $v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}$ (and only they) are extreme rays of $P$.

The problem of constructing the representation $(* *)$ if representation $(*)$ is available is called the vertex enumeration problem. It can be reduced to the analogous problem for cones as follows.

Consider the cone in $\mathbf{R}^{d+1}$

$$
C=\left\{\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}, x_{n+1}\right)^{\top} \in \mathbf{R}^{d+1}: A x \geq b x_{n+1}, B x=c x_{n+1}, x_{n+1} \geq 0\right\}
$$

where $x=\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right)^{\top}$. For the cone $C$ we can get a dual representation

$$
C=\operatorname{Lin}\left(\bar{u}_{1}, \ldots, \bar{u}_{p}\right)+\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(\bar{v}_{1}, \ldots, \bar{v}_{q}\right)
$$

for some vectors $\bar{u}_{1}, \ldots, \bar{u}_{p}, \bar{v}_{1}, \ldots, \bar{v}_{q}$ in $\mathbf{R}^{d+1}$.
Let $\bar{u}_{i}=\left(u_{i}, u_{i, n+1}\right)(i=1, \ldots, p), \bar{v}_{i}=\left(v_{i}, v_{i, n+1}\right)(i=1, \ldots, q)$. Since the system of homogenius linear inequalities and equations contains the inequality $x_{n+1} \geq 0$, then it is clear that $u_{i, n+1}=0(i=1, \ldots, p)$. Suppose w.l.g. that $v_{i, n+1}=0(i=1, \ldots, s), v_{i, n+1} \neq 0(i=s+1, \ldots, q)$. Now it is not hard to see that the initial polyhedron $P$ has the following dual representation:

$$
\begin{aligned}
P= & \operatorname{Lin}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)+ \\
& +\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{s}\right)+\operatorname{Conv}\left(\frac{1}{v_{s+1, d+1}} \cdot v_{s+1}, \ldots, \frac{1}{v_{q, d+1}} \cdot v_{q}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

Moreover, if the system $\bar{u}_{1}, \ldots, \bar{u}_{p}$ is a basis of the maximal linear subspace in $C$ and the system $\bar{v}_{1}, \ldots, \bar{v}_{q}$ is a skeleton of $C$ then the system of vectors constructed to describe $P$ also has the property of minimality. In particular, if $p=0$ then $\frac{1}{v_{s+1, d+1}} \cdot v_{s+1}, \ldots, \frac{1}{v_{q, d+1}} \cdot v_{q}$ are vertices of $P$.

From Weyl's theorem we get the following.
Theorem 5 For any vectors $u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}, v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}, w_{1}, \ldots, w_{s}$, in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$ there exist matrices $A \in \mathbf{R}^{m \times d}$ and $B \in \mathbf{R}^{t \times d}$ and vectors $b \in \mathbf{R}_{m}, c \in \mathbf{R}^{t}$ such that

$$
\begin{aligned}
\operatorname{Lin}\left(u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}\right)+\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}\right)+ & \operatorname{Conv}\left(w_{1}, \ldots, w_{s}\right)= \\
& =\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: A x \geq b, B x=c\right\} .
\end{aligned}
$$

Matrices $A$ and $B$ can be chosen in such a way that the following properties of minimality hold:

1. the system $B x=c$ is irreducible and $\{x: B x=c\}$ is the minimal linear variety containing $P$; and
2. $m$ is minimal among all possible $m$ such that $(*)$ holds (this means also that the system $A x \geq 0$ is irreducible).

In this case the rows in the matrix $(A, b)$ correspond to faces of maximum dimension. In particular, if $P$ is full-dimensional, i.e.

$$
\operatorname{rank}\left\{u_{1}, \ldots, u_{p}, v_{1}, \ldots, v_{q}, w_{1}-w_{s}, \ldots, w_{s-1}-w_{s}\right\}=d
$$

and, hence, $t=0$, then the rows in $(A, b)$ correspond to facets of $P$.
The problem of constructing the representation $(*)$ if representation $(* *)$ is available is called the facet enumeration problem, or the convex hull problem. It can be reduced to the analogous problem for cones as follows.

In $\mathbf{R}^{d+1}$ consider the cone

$$
C=\operatorname{Lin}\left(\bar{u}_{1}, \ldots, \bar{u}_{p}\right)+\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(\bar{v}_{1}, \ldots, \bar{v}_{q}, \bar{w}_{1}, \ldots, \bar{w}_{s}\right),
$$

where $\bar{u}_{i}=\left(u_{i}, 0\right)(i=1, \ldots, p), \bar{v}_{i}=\left(v_{i}, 0\right)(i=1, \ldots, q), \bar{w}_{i}=\left(w_{i}, 1\right)$ $(i=1, \ldots, s)$ and find its representation

$$
C=\left\{\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{d}, x_{d+1}\right)^{\top} \in \mathbf{R}^{d+1}: A x-b x_{d+1} \geq 0, B x-c x_{d+1}=0\right\},
$$

where $x=\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{d}\right) \in \mathbf{R}^{d}$. Now it is not hard to see that the initial polyhedron $P$ has the following representation:

$$
P=\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: A x \geq b, B x=c\right\} .
$$

Moreover, if $A, B, b, c$ are such that each of the systems $A x-b x_{d+1} \geq 0$ and $B x=c x_{d+1}$ is irreducible and $\left\{\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{d}, x_{d+1}\right)^{\top} \in \mathbf{R}^{d+1}: B x-c x_{d+1}=0\right\}$ is the minimal subspace containing $C$ then the system of inequalities and equations constructed to describe $P$ also has a property of minimality.

### 3.3 The main idea of the algorithm

Given a matrix $A \in \mathbf{R}^{m \times d}$, DDM generates a basis of maximal subspace and a skeleton of the cone $C=\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: A x \geq 0\right\}$. Obviously, the case then the cone is defined by a system of linear inequalities and equations can be reduced to the case with only inequalities.

In the preliminary step of DDM the rank $r$ of $A$ and a basis of the maximal subspace containing in $C$ are founded. Also, a skeleton of the cone determined by some irreducible subsystem containing $r$ inequalities is generated. Then, other inequalities are added one after the other and every time the skeleton is re-conctructed. Consider this slightly in detail.

Let $K$ be a cone determined by some subsystem of $A x \geq 0$. Suppose that a skeleton of $K$ is known. Consider what will happen with the skeleton then a new inequality $a x \geq 0$ is added.

Each vector in the skeleton of $K$ falls to one of the following sets:

1. $W_{0}$ is the set of all vectors $w$ in the skeleton such that $a w=0$;
2. $W_{+}$is the set of all vectors $w$ in the skeleton such that $a w \geq 0$;
3. $W_{-}$is the set of all vectors $w$ in the skeleton such that $a w \leq 0$.

A skeleton of the new cone is formed by all elements in $W_{+}$and $W_{0}$ and vectors which we obtain as follows. For each pair of vectors $w^{\prime} \in W_{+}$and $w^{\prime \prime} \in W_{-}$ adjacent in $K$ we obtain their linear combination $w$ satisfying to equality $a w=0$. Every such $w$ should be included to the skeleton of the new cone.

Variations of DDM differs one from another by ordering in which inequalities are choose from the system, the methods used to find adjacent rays, a time when the adjacency is computed and others [VPS84, FP96, SC97]. Checking the adjacency seems the most time-expensive procedure in DDM and different techniques to determine what pairs of vectors should be verifying are used [FP96].

## 4 How to Build

The source code of Skeleton is available at http://uic.nnov.ru/~zny/skeleton. The package contains a documentation, examples, Arageli library and three C++ files: skeleton.cpp, ddm.hpp and ddmio.hpp.

Skeleton uses Arageli library [Ara10]. Arageli is included in the distribution and it will be compiled automatically. To use newer version of Arageli (for example downloaded from the site [Ara10]), just replace it in the directory tools/arageli.

To compile the code in standard Linux environment you need gcc version 4 or above. Type

## make

We supposed to be in the root directory of skeleton distribution, so after that command, binary skeleton will appear in the root directory of the distribution.

To compile the code in Windows you can use MS Visual Studio 2008 or later. Please refer to msvs_2008 directory and skeleton.sln solution file (just build entire solution). Note that for this building way, executables will appear in bin directory and will be named by pattern skeleton $\{32,64\}\{d, r, f, t\}$.exe corresponding to choosen configuration ( 32 or 64 bit and Debug, Release, Fast or Test configuration). The fastest configuration is Fast (skeleton32f.exe or skeleton64f.exe depending on operating system used), so make sure that Fast configuration is choosen before building MS Visual Studio solution.

## 5 How to Use

Given a matrix $A \in \mathbf{Z}^{m \times d}$, program Skeleton generates a basis of maximal subspace and a skeleton of the cone $C=\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: A x \geq 0\right\}$.

To use Skeleton, first of all, one should prepare a file with your data. The file must contain the size and entries of matrix $A$. Numbers are separated by spaces and blank lines. For example, if you want to find a skeleton of the cone
$C$ defined as a set of solution to the system

$$
\left\{\begin{aligned}
x_{1} & \geq 0 \\
-x_{1}+x_{3}+x_{4} & \geq 0 \\
-x_{2}+x_{3} & \geq 0 \\
x_{3}+x_{4} & \geq 0 \\
x_{1}+x_{2}+x_{4} & \geq 0 \\
-x_{1}-x_{2} & -x_{4}
\end{aligned}\right.
$$

then the input file (say example.ine) is

```
64
    1}0
-1
    0 -1 1 0
    0
    1
-1 -1 0 -1
```

To run Skeleton just type in the command prompt:
skeleton filename
where filename is the name of the input file. Example:
skeleton example.ine
(The file example.ine and other example files mentioned below is in the folder examples.)

Skeleton produces two files: "output" file, "log" file and "summary" file. By default, their names are obtained by adding extention .out, .log, .sum respectively to input file name. In our example Skeleton produces files example.ine.out, example.ine.log, and example.ine.sum.

The output file contains sizes and entries of matrix $U$ (vectors of a basis in row-wise order) and matrix $V$ (vectors of a skeleton). Also, the file can contain other information (it depends on options used; see the list of available options below). In our example we get the following file example.ine.out: Thus, we get $u_{1}=(0,-1,-1,1)^{\top}, v_{1}=(1,-1,1,0)^{\top}, v_{2}=(0,0,1,0)^{\top}$ and $C=\operatorname{Lin}\left(u_{1}\right)+\operatorname{NonNeg}\left(v_{1}, v_{2}\right)$.

The log file contains computation hystory. By default, this information is also displayed on stdcrt during computation. In our example we get the following file example.ine.log:

The summary file contains computation summary. By default, this information are also displayed on stdcrt after computation. In our example we get the following file example.ine.sum:

You may set different options affecting the process of computation and the output of information:
skeleton filename options
where options is a list of options. Each option is an abbreviation usually beginning with double hyphen. Options are separated by spaces. Example:

```
skeleton example.ine --lexmin --adjacency
```

Complete list of all available options is in the next section.

## 6 Options

The following options are available (the default parameters are in braces):

$$
\{-- \text { minindex }\},\{--m a x i n d e x\},--l e x m i n,--l e x m a x,--r a n d o m,--m i n c u t o f f,
$$

--maxcutoff, --minpairs, --maxpairs
These options affect the ordering of inequalities to be added at each iteration of DDM.

## --prefixedorder, --noprefixedorder

If options --mincutoff, --maxcutoff, --minpairs, --maxpairs are chosen then only --noprefixedorder is possible. In other cases both options are available; the default one is --prefixedorder.
\{--graphadj\}, --nographadj
These affect the way of determining adjacent vectors.
\{--plusplus\}, --noplusplus
If option --plusplus is chosen then only the pairs of adjacent vectors that will be necessary on the future iterations are constructed. If option --noplusplus is chosen then all edges are constructed on each iteration.
\{--bigint $\},--i n t,--f l o a t$
By default, arbitrary precision integer arithmetic is used. Option --int forces to use ordinary ( 4 bytes) integer precision arithmetic. Option --float forces to use double floating point ( 8 bytes) arithmetic. Option --rational forces to use rational arithmetic when exact enumerator / exact denominator pair is used to represent rational number.
--zerotol value
The option affects only if option --float is used. This is used to change a zero tolerance for floating point computation. A real value is considered as zero if its absolute value is at most the tolerance. The default value for the zero tolerance is $1 \mathrm{e}-8$.
--edges, $\{-$-noedges $\}$
Option --edges forces to find edges, i.e. all pairs of adjacent vectors in the skeleton.
--adjacency, \{--noadjacency\}
Option --adjacency forces to find the lists of skeleton vectors adjacent to each one.
--ridges, \{--noridges\}
Option --ridges forces to find ridges, i.e. all pairs of adjacent facets.
--facetadjacency, \{--nofacetadjacency\}
Option --facetadjacency forces to find the lists of facets adjacent to each one.
--verifyine, \{--noverifyine\}
Option --verifyine forces to determine implicit equations and redundand inequalities in the input system.
--inputfile filename
This option defines input file name. skeleton --inputfile filename is equivalent to skeleton filename.
-o filename --outputfile filename
This option sets the name of output file. By default, this name is obtained by adding extention .out to input file name. If input was from stdin then output file is skeleton.out.
--logfile filename
This option sets the name of $\log$ file. By default, this name is obtained by adding extention .log to input file name. If input was from stdin then $\log$ file is skeleton.log.
--summaryfile filename
This option sets the name of summary file. By default, this name is obtained by adding extention .sum to input file name. If input was from stdin then $\log$ file is skeleton.sum.
--inputfromstdin, \{--noinputfromstdin\} --inputfromstdin forces to read input information fron stdin instead of file.
\{--simpleformat\}, --skeletonformat, --avisfukudaformat
--skeletonformat indicates that input containes both inequalities and equations (both $A$ and $B$ matrices).
--avisfukudaformat indicates that input is in Avis-Fukuda format (see [Fuk02]); all options in the file are ignored; only matrix in begin-end parentheses is read; the number type specificator (integer, ration etc.) is ignored.
\{--outputinfile\}, --nooutputinfile
If --nooutputinfile is chosen then SkELETON will not put results in output file.
--outputonstdout, $\{-$-nooutputonstdout $\}$
If --outputonstdin is chosen then SKELETON will put results on stdout.
\{--loginfile\}, --nologinfile
If --nologinfile is chosen then Skeleton will not put log information in $\log$ file.
\{--logonstdout\}, --nologonstdout
If --nologonstdout is chosen then Skeleton will not put log information on stdout.
\{--summaryinfile\},--nosummaryinfile
If --nosummaryinfile is chosen then Skeleton will not put summary information in summary file.
\{--summaryonstdout\}, --nosummaryonstdout
If --nosummaryonstdout is chosen then SkeLeton will not put summary information on stdout.
--silence
This option is equivalent to --nooutputonstdout, --nologonstdout, --nosummaryonstdout.
--ine, $\{-$-noine $\}$
If --ine is chosen then Skeleton will put the input matrix $A$ (coefficients of linear inequalities) on stdout or/and in outputfile. This works only if option --outputinfile or --outputonstdout correspondingly turns on.
--equ, $\{--$ noequ $\}$
If --equ is chosen then Skeleton will put the input matrix $B$ (coefficients of linear equations) on stdout or/and in outputfile. This works only if option --outputinfile or --outputonstdout correspondingly turns on.
\{--ext $\},--$ noext
If --noext is chosen then Skeleton will not put the matrix $V$ (with entries of skeleton vectors) on stdout and in outputfile. This works only if option --outputinfile or --outputonstdout correspondingly turns on.
\{--bas\}, --nobas
If --nobas is chosen then Skeleton will not put the matrix $U$ (with entries of basis of maximal subspace contained in the cone) on stdout and in outputfile. This works only if option --outputinfile or --outputonstdout correspondingly turns on.
--dis, \{--nodis $\}$
If --dis is chosen then Skeleton will put the discrepancies matrix $V A^{\top}$ on stdout or/and in outputfile. This works only if option --outputinfile or --outputonstdout correspondingly turns on.
--extinc, $\{-$-noextinc $\}$
If --extinc is chosen then for each vector in skeleton the program will print (on stdout or/and in outputfile) iniqualities which hold as equality. This works only if option --outputinfile or --outputonstdout correspondingly turns on.
--ineinc, $\{-$-noineinc $\}$
If --ineinc is chosen then for each inequality in the initial system the program will print (on stdout or/and in outputfile) vectors in the skeleton for which the inequality holds as equality. This works only if option --outputinfile or --outputonstdout correspondingly turns on.

```
--matrices, --nomatrices
```

    --matrices is equivalent to --ine, --ext, --bas, --inc; --nomatrices
    is equivalent to --noine, --noext, --nobas, --noinc. This works only
    if option --outputinfile or --outputonstdout turns on.
    $\{--\log \},--n o l o g$
If --nolog is chosen no log information will not put on stdout and in log file. This works only if option --summaryinfile or --summaryonstdout turns on.
\{--summary\}, --nosummary
If --nosummary is chosen no summary information (input/output/log file names, sizes of matrices and option values) will not put on stdout and in summary file. This works only if option --summaryinfile or --summaryonstdout turns on.
-h or --help
skeleton -h prints the list of available options and terminates the program. skeleton --help does the same.
-v or --version
skeleton -v prints Skeleton version and terminates the program.
skeleton --version does the same.
--copying
skeleton --copying prints copyright info: GNU GENERAL PUBLIC LICENSE Version 2.

## 7 More Examples

### 7.1 Cube With a Cutted Vertex

Consider the polyhedron described by the following system:

$$
\left\{\begin{align*}
x_{1} & \geq 0  \tag{1}\\
& x_{2} \\
& \geq 0 \\
x_{3} & \geq 0 \\
x_{1} & \leq 1 \\
& \\
x_{2} & \leq 1 \\
x_{3} & \leq 1 \\
2 x_{1}+2 x_{2}+2 x_{3} & \leq 5
\end{align*}\right.
$$

It is a cube with a "cutted" vertex (see Fig. 1).


Figure 1: Cube with a cutted vertex. Facet representation


Figure 2: Cube with a cutted vertex. Vertex representation

The corresponding cone is described by the following homogenious system:

$$
\left\{\begin{align*}
x_{1} & \geq 0  \tag{2}\\
x_{2} & \geq 0 \\
& \geq 0 \\
x_{3}+x_{4} & \geq 0 \\
-x_{1} & \geq 0 \\
-x_{2}-x_{3}+x_{4} & \geq 0 \\
-2 x_{1}-2 x_{2}-2 x_{3}+5 x_{4} & \geq 0 \\
x_{4} & \geq 0
\end{align*}\right.
$$

(setting $x_{4}=1$ we get the initial system). So, input file (named cwcv.ine) is
84

| 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| 1 | -1 | 0 | 0 |
| 1 | 0 | -1 | 0 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | -1 |
| 5 | -2 | -2 | -2 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

Running Skeleton with
skeleton cwcv.ine --edges --ineinc
we get the following file cwcv.ine.out:
Matrix with entries of the basis is empty (it contains 0 rows), hence the polyhedron does not contain any non-zero linear variety. Matrix with entries of the skeleton has 10 rows, hence the polyhedron has 10 vertex (see Fig. 2). The forth coordinate corresponds to the denominator in entries of all these vertices. They are $v_{1}=(1,0,0)^{\top}, v_{2}=(1,1,0)^{\top}, v_{3}=\left(1,1, \frac{1}{2}\right)^{\top}, v_{4}=(1,0,1)^{\top}$, $v_{5}=\left(1, \frac{1}{2}, 1\right)^{\top}, v_{6}=(0,0,1)^{\top}, v_{7}=(0,1,1)^{\top}, v_{10}=\left(\frac{1}{2}, 1,1\right)^{\top}, v_{1}=(0,1,0)^{\top}$, $v_{1}=(0,0,0)^{\top}$.

Also, we have computed all edges, i.e. pairs of adjacent vertices. The polyhedron has 15 edges. They are $v_{1}-v_{2}, v_{1}-v_{4}, v_{1}-v_{10}, v_{2}-v_{3}, v_{2}-v_{9}, v_{3}-v_{5}, v_{3}-v_{8}$, $v_{4}-v_{5}, v_{4}-v_{6}, v_{5}-v_{8}, v_{6}-v_{7}, v_{6}-v_{10}, v_{7}-v_{8}, v_{7}-v_{9}, v_{9}-v_{10}$.

Information concerning "Inequalities-to-rays incidence" tell us that 7 facets are formed by vertices $v_{6}, v_{7}, v_{9}, v_{10} ; v_{1}, v_{4}, v_{6}, v_{10} ; v_{1}, v_{2}, v_{9}, v_{10} ; v_{1}, v_{2}, v_{3}$, $v_{4}, v_{5} ; v_{2}, v_{3}, v_{7}, v_{8}, v_{9} ; v_{4}, v_{5}, v_{6}, v_{7}, v_{8} ; v_{3}, v_{5}, v_{8}$ correspondingly.

Now we can check our computations by "reversing" them. Form the input file (named cwcv.ext) containing entries of vertices found:

```
104
1 1 0 0
1110
2 2 2 1
```

1101
2212
1001
1011
2122
1010
1000
and evoke Skeleton:
skeleton cwcv.ext
We get the following file cwcv.ext. out: Since the matrix with "basis" is empty the polyhedron has full dimension. The matrix with "skeleton" has 7 rows. They correspond to exactly the same inequalities as in (1), so the polyhedron has 7 facets. We remark that in the list obtained there is no row corresponding to the inequality $x_{4} \geq 0$ because in our case it is redundant in (2).

### 7.2 Implicit equations and redundant inequalities

SKELETON can find implicit equations and redundant inequalities in a system. Let's consider the system

$$
\left\{\begin{aligned}
x_{1} & \geq 0 \\
x_{2} & \geq 0 \\
x_{3} & \geq 0 \\
x_{4} & \geq 0 \\
x_{1}+2 x_{2}+3 x_{4} & \geq 0 \\
x_{1}+x_{2}+x_{3}+3 x_{4} & \geq 0 \\
x_{1}-2 x_{2}+x_{3}+3 x_{4} & \geq 0 \\
-x_{1}+2 x_{2}-x_{3}-3 x_{4} & \geq 0
\end{aligned}\right.
$$

So, the input file (named equ.ine) is

```
84
1000
0 0 0
0 0 1 0
0 0 0 1
1203
1113
1 -2 1 3
-1 2 -1 -3
```

Running Skeleton with
skeleton equ.ine --verifyine
we get the following file equ.ine.out:
This mean that two inequalities in the original system, the 7 th and the 8th, are implicit equations; the $2 \mathrm{nd}, 5$ th and 6 th inequalities are redundant.

### 7.3 Skeleton "extended" format

Skeleton can treat systems containing both inequalities and equations (explicitly defined): both $A$ and $B$ matrices. For this it is necessary to use a special format in the input file. Here is an example:

$$
\left\{\begin{aligned}
x_{1}-x_{2}-x_{3} & =0 \\
x_{1} & \geq 0 \\
x_{2} & \geq 0 \\
x_{3} & \geq 0
\end{aligned}\right.
$$

The input file (names sf.ine) follows.

```
* Equations:
```

13
1-1 -1

* Inequalities:

33
100
010
001

Running Skeleton with
skeleton sf.ine --skeletonformat
we get the following file sf.ine.out:

### 7.4 Avis-Fukuda format

Skeleton partially supports Avis-Fukuda format (see [Avi, Fuk02]). All options (except a matrix inside begin-end parentheses) in the file are ignored. The number type specificator (integer, ration etc.) is also ignored. Note that the most of options in Avis-Fukuda format has equivalent ones in Skeleton but they must be indicated in command line.

Let's consider, for example, the file ucube. ine taken from K. Fukuda cdd repository [Fuk02]:

* file name: ucube.ine
* 3 cube without one "lid"

H-representation
begin

|  |  |  | 4 |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | :--- |
| 2 | -1 | 0 | 0 |
| 2 | 0 | -1 | 0 |
| -1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| -1 | 0 | 1 | 0 |



Figure 3: Voronoi diagram for the set of points

```
-1 0}000
    4
end
incidence
adjacency
input_adjacency
input_incidence
Run Skeleton:
```

```
skeleton ucube.ine --avisfukudaformat --adjacency --facetadjacency
```

                    --extinc --ineinc
    The output file is The log file is

### 7.5 Voronoi Diagram

Let $W$ be a system of $s$ points in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$. For each $w \in W$ we can consider the set

$$
\operatorname{VS}(w)=\left\{x \in \mathbf{R}^{d}: \forall v \in W \backslash\{w\} \quad \operatorname{dist}(x, p) \leq \operatorname{dist}(x, q)\right\},
$$

where dist is the Euclidean distance function. The set $\mathrm{VS}(w)$ is called a Voronoi cell. It is a polyhedron. Its vertices are called Voronoi vertices and extreme rays are called Voronoi rays. The set $\{\operatorname{VS}(w): w \in W\}$ of all Voronoi cells is called Voronoi diagram (see Fig.3). For generating Voronoi diagram the following construction is widely used.

For each $w \in W$ consider the hyperplane tangent at $w=\left(w_{1}, \ldots, w_{d}\right)^{\top}$ to the paraboloid $\left\{\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{d}, x_{d+1}\right): x_{d+1}=x_{1}^{2}+\ldots+x_{d}^{2}\right\}$. This hyperplane is represented by the following equation:

$$
-2 w_{1} x_{1}-\ldots-2 w_{d} x_{d}+x_{d+1}+w_{1}^{2}+\ldots+w_{d}^{2}=0
$$

Replacing the equality with inequality $\geq$ and considering these inequalities for each $w \in W$ we get the system of $s$ linear inequalities. Let $P$ be the polyhedron of all solutions to the system. It turns out that $P$ is a lifting of Voronoi diagram to one higher dimensional space; and the projection of each facet of $P$ associated with $w$ is exactly the Voronoi cell $\operatorname{VS}(w)$. The vertices and extreme rays of $P$ project exactly to the Voronoi vertices and rays, respectively [Fuk04].

As an example consider the set of points $(0,0)^{\top},(2,0)^{\top},(-2,0)^{\top},(0,1)^{\top}$, $(1,2)^{\top},(-1,2)^{\top},(0,3)^{\top}$. For generating their Voronoi diagram consider the system

Prepare file exvoronoi.ine:
84
0010
-4 014
4014
$0-211$
-2 -4 $1 \begin{array}{llll} & 5\end{array}$
2-4 1 5
$0-619$
0001
Now evoke Skeleton:
skeleton exvoronoi.ine --ineinc --extinc
We get the following file exvoronoi.ine.out:
Each extreme ray with last entry equal to 0 corresponds to a Voronoi ray. Each ray whose last entry is non-zero corresponds to a Voronoi vertex. So, we get 5 Voronoi rays (ignoring the third component):

$$
v_{1}=(0,-1)^{\top}, v_{2}=(1,1)^{\top}, v_{3}=(2,1)^{\top}, v_{4}=(-1,1)^{\top}, v_{5}=(-2,1)^{\top}
$$

and 5 Voronoi vertices (dividing by the forth component and ignoring the third one):

$$
\begin{gathered}
v_{6}=\left(-1, \frac{1}{2}\right)^{\top}, \quad v_{7}=\left(1, \frac{1}{2}\right)^{\top}, \quad v_{8}=(0,2)^{\top} \\
v_{9}=\left(-\frac{7}{6}, \frac{5}{6}\right)^{\top}, \quad v_{10}=\left(\frac{7}{6}, \frac{5}{6}\right)^{\top} .
\end{gathered}
$$

Interpreting "Edges" or/and "Inequalities-to-rays incidence" we get Fig. 4.


Figure 4: Voronoi diagram constructed with the help of Skeleton


Figure 5: Delaunay triangulation is dual to Voronoi diagram

### 7.6 Delaunay Triangulation

Let $W$ be a system of $s$ points in $\mathbf{R}^{d}$ and $v$ be some Voronoi vertex for $W$. The convex hull of the nearest neighbor set of $v$ is called the Delaunay cell of $v$. The Delaunay complex (or triangulation) of $W$ is a partition of Conv $W$ into the Delaunay cells of Voronoi vertices.

The Delaunay complex is not in general a triangulation but becomes a triangulation when the points in $W$ are in general position (or nondegenerate), i.e. no $d+2$ points are cospherical or equivalently there is no point $c \in \mathbf{R}^{d}$ whose nearest neighbor set has more than $d+1$ elements.

The Delaunay complex is dual to the Voronoi diagram in the sense that there is a natural bijection between the two complexes which reverses the face inclusions (see Fig. 5) [Fuk04].

So, to generate Delaunay triangulation we can perform the following procedure. For each vertex of polyhedra (we are not interesting in extreme rays) in previous section we determine all facets incident to the vertex. Interpreting information about "Rays-to-inequalities incidence" in exvoronoi.ine.out we get that Delaunay cells in this example are formed by the following vertices $w_{1}$, $w_{3}, w_{4} ; w_{1}, w_{2}, w_{4} ; w_{2}, w_{4}, w_{5} ; w_{3}, w_{4}, w_{6} ; w_{4}, w_{5}, w_{6}, w_{7}$ (see Fig. 5).

There is a direct way to construct the Delaunay triangulation. Consider the same paraboloid as in the previous section: $x_{d+1}=x_{1}^{2}+\ldots+x_{d}^{2}$. For each point $w=\left(w_{1}, \ldots, w_{d}\right)^{\top}$ in $W$ consider its lifting $\left(w_{1}, \ldots, w_{d}, w_{1}^{2}+\ldots+w_{d}^{2}\right)^{\top}$ in $\mathbf{R}^{d+1}$ and take the convex hull $P$ of all such lifted points. Let $v=(0, \ldots, 0,1)$. It turns out that any facet of $P+\operatorname{NonNeg}(v)$ which is not parallel to $v$ is a Delaunay cell once its last coordinate is ignored, and any Delaunay cell is represented this way [Fuk04].

For our example form the file exdelaunay.ext:

```
84
    0 0 0 1
    2 0 4 1
-2 0 4 1
    0 1 1 1
    1 2 5 1
-1 2 5 1
    0 3 9 1
    0 0 1 0
```

and evoke Skeleton:

```
skeleton exdelaunay.ext --extinc
```

We get the file exdelaunay. ext.out: Only first 5 facets are not parallel to $v$ (because their 3rd coordinate is non-zero). So, we again have 5 Delaunay cells which are formed by points $w_{1}, w_{3}, w_{4} ; w_{1}, w_{2}, w_{4} ; w_{4}, w_{5}, w_{6}, w_{7} ; w_{3}, w_{4}, w_{6}$; $w_{2}, w_{4}, w_{5}$ correspondingly (see Fig. 5).

## References

[Ara10] Arageli: a library for doing exact computation. http://www. arageli.org, 2006-2010.
[Avi] D. Avis. lrs homepage. http://cgm.cs.mcgill.ca/~avis/C/lrs. html.
[Bur56] E. Burger. Über homogene lineare ungleichungssysteme. Zeitschrift für Angewandte Mathematik und Mechanik, 36:135-139, 1956.
[Che64] N.V. Chernikova. Algorithm for finding a general formula for the non-negative solutions of system of linear equations. U.S.S.R. Computational Mathematics and Mathematical Physics, 4(4):151-158, 1964.
[Che65] N.V. Chernikova. Algorithm for finding a general formula for the non-negative solutions of system of linear inequalities. U.S.S.R. Computational Mathematics and Mathematical Physics, 5(2):228233, 1965.
[Che68a] S.N. Chernikov. Linear inequalities. Nauka, Moscow, 1968. Russian.
[Che68b] N.V. Chernikova. Algorithm for discovering the set of all solutions of a linear programming problem. U.S.S.R. Computational Mathematics and Mathematical Physics, 8(6):282-293, 1968.
[FP96] K. Fukuda and A. Prodon. Double description method revisited. In M. Deza, R. Euler, and I. Manoussakis, editors, Lecture Notes in Computer Science, volume 1120, pages 91-111. SpringerVerlag, 1996. ps file available from ftp.ifor.math.ethz.ch, directory /pub/fukuda/reports.
[FQ88] F. Fernández and P. Quinton. Extension of Chernikova's algorithm for solving general mixed linear programming problems. Technical report, IRISA, Rennes, France, 1988.
[Fuk02] K. Fukuda. cdd, cddplus and cddlib homepage. http://www.cs. mcgill.ca/ $\sim_{f u k u d a / s o f t w a r e / c d d h o m e / c d d . h t m l, ~}^{2002 .}$
[Fuk04] K. Fukuda. Frequently asked questions in polyhedral computation. http://www.ifor.math.ethz.ch/staff/fukuda/polyfaq/ polyfaq.html, 2004.
[Gru03] D.V. Gruzdev. Experimental comparison of algorithms for constructing convex hulls and triangulations. In O.B. Lupanov, editor, Proceeding of the XIV International Workshop "Synthesys and Complexity of Control Systems, pages 24-26, Nizhni Novgorod, 2003. Nizhni Novgorod Pedagogical University. Russian.
[MRTT53] T.S. Motzkin, H. Raiffa, G.L. Thompson, and R.M. Thrall. The double description method. In H.W. Kuhn and A.W.Tucker, editors, Contributions to Theory of Games, volume 2, Princeton, RI, 1953. Princeton University Press.
[SC97] V.N. Shevchenko and A.Yu. Chirkov. On complexity of constructing the skeleton of the cone. In X Russian conference "Mathematical programming and applications", page 237, Ekaterinburgh, 1997. Ural department of Russian Academy of Science. Russian.
[SG03] V.N. Shevchenko and D.V. Gruzdev. Modification of FourieMotzkin algorithm for constructing triangulations. Discrete Analisys and Operations Research, Series 2, 10(10):53-64, 2003. Russian.
[Ver92] H.Le. Verge. A note on Chernikova's algorithm. Technical Report 635, IRISA, Campus de Beaulieu, Rennes, France, 1992.
[VPS84] S.I. Veselov, I.E. Parubochiŭ, and V.N. Shevchenko. A program for finding the skeleton of the cone of nonnegative solutions of a system of linear inequalities. In Systems and Applied Programs. Part 2, pages 83-92, Gorky, 1984. Gorky State University. Russian.
[Zol97] N.Yu. Zolotykh. Program implementation of Motzkin-Bürger algorithm for finding the skeleton of a polyhedral cone and its applications. In M.A. Antonets, V.E. Alekseyev, and V.N. Shevchenko, editors, Proceeding of the 2nd International Conference"Mathematical Algorithms", pages 72-74, Nizhni Novgorod, 1997. Nizhni Novgorod State University. Russian.

